

# Minutes

---

## Planning and Development Control Committee Tuesday, 2nd September, 2014

### Attendance

Cllr Baker (Chair)	Cllr Mrs Hones
Cllr Mynott (Vice-Chair)	Cllr Hossack
Cllr Carter	Cllr McCheyne
Cllr Cloke	Cllr Morrissey
Cllr Mrs Cohen	Cllr Mrs Squirrell
Cllr Mrs Henwood	

### Apologies

### Substitute Present

### Also Present

Cllr Aspinell	
Cllr Mrs Murphy	
Cllr Parker	
Cllr Dicker	Doddinghurst Parish Council
Cllr Foan	West Horndon Parish Council
Cllr North	Kelvedon Hatch Parish Council
Cllr Poston	Ingatestone and Fryerning Parish Council

### Officers Present

Tony Pierce	Interim Head of Planning
Yee Cheung	Senior Planning Officer
Philip Cunliffe-Jones	Planning Solicitor
Caroline McCaffrey	Development Management Team Leader
David Carter	Senior EHO (Team Leader)
Alan Marsh	Arboricultural Assistant
Paulette McAllister	Design & Conservation Officer
Sukhvinder Dhadwar	Planning Officer
Martyn Earl	Senior Planning Officer

**115. Apologies for absence**

No apologies were received.

**116. Minutes from previous meeting**

The minutes of the meeting were approved and signed by the Chair as a correct record.

**117. THE SURGERY SITE AND LANDINGS OUTINGS LANE DODDINGHURST  
ESSEX CM15 0LS**

**DEMOLITION OF FORMER DOCTORS SURGERY AND ADJACENT  
DWELLING KNOWN AS THE LANDINGS AND CONSTRUCTION OF 5 NO.  
DETACHED DWELLINGS.**

**APPLICATION NO: 14/00627/FUL**

Mr Miles, the objector, addressed the Committee objecting to the application.

Mr Haynes, the applicant, declared not to speak in support of the application.

Support of the application was received by Mrs Dicker, Doddinghurst Parish Council and Ward Members.

After a full discussion a motion was **MOVED** by Cllr McCheyne and **SECONDED** by Cllr Mrs Hones to approve the application.

**FOR:** Cllrs Cloke, McCheyne, Mrs Henwood, Mrs Hones and  
Cllr Hossack (5)

**AGAINST:** Cllrs Baker, Carter, Mrs Cohen, Morrissey, Mynott and  
Mrs Squirrell (6)

**ABSTAIN:** (0)

The motion was **LOST**.

A motion was **MOVED** by Cllr Baker and **SECONDED** by Cllr Mynott to refuse the application.

**FOR:** Cllrs Baker, Carter, Mrs Cohen, Morrissey, Mynott and  
Mrs Squirrell (6)

**AGAINST:** Cllrs Cloke, McCheyne, Mrs Henwood, Mrs Hones and  
Cllr Hossack (5)

ABSTAIN: (0)

(Cllr Baker and other members declared a non pecuniary interest under the Councils Code of Conduct by virtue of knowing the objector).

RESOLVED the planning permission be REFUSED for the following reasons:-

R1 U08182

The proposed development does not seek to provide any affordable housing contributions to the detriment of local housing opportunities and social inclusion, contrary to Policy H9 of the Brentwood Replacement Local Plan 2005 and Chapter 6 of the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) which encourages the delivery of a wide choice of high quality homes, seeks to widen opportunities for home ownership and aims to create sustainable, inclusive and mixed communities.

R2 U08183

The design of the dwellings, particularly the two dwellings at the front of the site (plots 1 and 5) are of a poor design which by virtue of their scale and design language would result in an incongruous form of development which fails to take into account the local distinctiveness of the area and which would harm the setting of the adjoining Listed Building contrary to Chapters 7 and 12 of the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) and Policies CP1 and C16 of the Brentwood Replacement Local Plan 2005.

**118. LAND ADJACENT TO HEATHLANDS SCHOOL ROAD KELVEDON HATCH ESSEX**

**OUTLINE APPLICATION (ACCESS, LAYOUT AND SCALE) FOR CONSTRUCTION OF TWO STOREY DETACHED DWELLING. (APPEARANCE AND LANDSCAPING RESERVED MATTERS)**

**APPLICATION NO: 14/00631/OUT**

Mr Chamber, the objector, addressed the Committee objection to the application.

Mr Driscoll, the agent, addressed the Committee in support of the application.

Views were expressed about the Tree Prevention Orders on the site by the Parish Council.

A motion was MOVED by Cllr McCheyne and SECONDED by Cllr Mrs Henwood to approve the application.

The Chair requested a recorded vote in accordance with Part 4.1 of the Constitution, Rule 9.5, 5 Members requested a recorded vote be taken and Members voted as followed:

FOR: Cllrs Cloke, McCheyne, Mrs Henwood and Mrs Hones (4)

AGAINST: Cllrs Baker, Carter, Mrs Cohen, Morrissey, Mynott and Mrs Squirrell (6)

ABSTAIN: Cllr Hossack (1)

The motion was LOST.

A motion was MOVED by Cllr Baker and SECONDED by Cllr Mynott to refuse the application.

The Chair requested a recorded vote in accordance with Part 4.1 of the Constitution, Rule 9.5, 5 Members requested a recorded vote be taken and Members voted as followed:

FOR: Cllrs Baker, Carter, Mrs Cohen, Morrissey, Mynott and Mrs Squirrell (6)

AGAINST: Cllrs Cloke, McCheyne, Mrs Henwood and Mrs Hones (4)

ABSTAIN: Cllr Hossack (1)

RESOLVED the planning permission be REFUSED for the following reasons:-

R1 U08182

The proposed development does not seek to provide any affordable housing contributions to the detriment of local housing opportunities and social inclusion, contrary to Policy H9 of the Brentwood Replacement Local Plan 2005 and Chapter 6 of the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) which encourages the delivery of a wide choice of high quality homes, seeks to widen opportunities for home ownership and aims to create sustainable, inclusive and mixed communities.

R2 U08183

The design of the dwellings, particularly the two dwellings at the front of the site (plots 1 and 5) are of a poor design which by virtue of their scale and design language would result in an incongruous form of development which fails to take into account the local distinctiveness of the area and which would harm the setting of the adjoining Listed Building contrary to Chapters 7 and 12 of the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) and Policies CP1 and C16 of the Brentwood Replacement Local Plan 2005.

**119. 23 HIGH STREET INGATESTONE ESSEX CM4 9DU**

**PARTIAL DEMOLITION OF LISTED BUILDING. CHANGE OF USE FROM OFFICES TO 5 FLATS (1 X 1 BEDROOM, 4 X 2 BEDROOMS), AND ERECTION OF 2 BEDROOM COTTAGE WITH ASSOCIATED CAR PARKING, CYCLE AND BIN STORAGE, AND EXTERNAL ALTERATIONS , INCLUDING NEW DORMERS.**

**APPLICATION NO: 14/00593/FUL**

Mr Cooper, the objector, addressed the Committee objection to the application.

Ward and Parish Council Members also spoke in objection for the application.

A motion was **MOVED** by Cllr Cloke and **SECONDED** by Cllr Mrs Hones to refuse the application.

**FOR:** Cllrs Carter, Cloke, Mrs Cohen, McCheyne, Mrs Henwood, Mrs Hones and Cllr Hossack (7)

**AGAINST:** Cllrs Baker and Mrs Squirrell (2)

**ABSTAIN:** Cllrs Morrissey and Mynott (2)

The motion was **CARRIED**.

**RESOLVED** the planning permission be **REFUSED** for the following reason:-

The cottage results in a cramped layout and poor relationship to neighbouring properties, impacting on the living conditions of The Barn, by loss of light and an overbearing effect.

**120. 23 HIGH STREET INGATESTONE ESSEX CM4 9DU**

**PARTIAL DEMOLITION OF LISTED BUILDING. CHANGE OF USE FROM OFFICES TO 5 FLATS (1 X 1 BEDROOM, 4 X 2 BEDROOMS), AND ERECTION OF 2 BEDROOM COTTAGE WITH ASSOCIATED CAR PARKING, CYCLE AND BIN STORAGE, AND EXTERNAL ALTERATIONS , INCLUDING NEW DORMERS.**

**APPLICATION NO: 14/00594/LBC**

As the only item for consideration was the impact of the proposal on the listed building and the impact from the cottage had been resolved in the previous item, the Committee resolved without discussion that the application for listed building consent be determined and refused accordingly.

**121. 149C -151HIGH STREET BRENTWOOD ESSEX CM14 4SA**

**CONVERSION OF OFFICES INTO 6 X 2 BEDROOM FLATS AND CONSTRUCTION OF AN ADDITIONAL STOREY TO PROVIDE AN ADDITIONAL 2 BEDROOM FLAT.**

**APPLICATION NO: 14/00648/FUL**

Mr Bender, on behalf of Save Brentwood Action Group, addressed the Committee in support of the application.

After a full discussion a motion was **MOVED** by Cllr Morrissey and **SECONDED** by Cllr Mynott to refuse the application.

**FOR:** Cllrs Baker, Carter, Cloke, Mrs Cohen, Mrs Henwood, Mrs Hones, Morrissey, Mynott and Mrs Squirrel (9)

**AGAINST:** (0)

**ABSTAIN:** Cllrs Hossack and McCheyne (2)

**RESOLVED** to **REFUSE** the application for the following reasons:

**R1 U08360**

The design proposed is not of good design with the architectural narrative lacking, the detailing approach cumbersome, the material palette unsuitable for the location and the fenestration and detailing to the balustrades unacceptable. The proposal is of a poor design which fails to reinforce local distinctness and fails to take the opportunities available for improving the character and quality of the area and fails to enhance the heritage assets it adjoins, contrary to Chapters 7 and 12 of the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) and Policies CP1(i), CP1(iii), C14 and C16 of the Brentwood Replacement Local Plan 2005.

**R2**

If a project architect is not engaged fully (and confirmation provided within 14 days from notice of refusal) with instructions to achieve an acceptable design, as required by para. 64 of the NPPF, authority is delegated to officers to serve an Enforcement Notice for breach of all conditions relating to application 13/00395/FUL.

**122. Urgent business**

There were no items of urgent business.